



# **KWAZULU-NATAL PROVINCIAL GOVERNMENT**

# **REPORT**

- OF THE PROVINCIAL TASK TEAM ON :**
- **THE ETHEKWINI EARLY MORNING MARKET AND;**
  - **THE WARWICK AVENUE MALL DEVELOPMENT**

# CONTENTS

	Page
INTRODUCTION	1
THE TASK TEAM AND ITS MODUS OPERANDI	3
SUBMISSIONS AND REPRESENTATIONS RECEIVED BY THE TASK TEAM	5
ISSUES WHICH ARE COMMON CAUSE BETWEEN THE PARTIES	12
ISSUES IN DISPUTE BETWEEN THE PARTIES	13
THE TASK TEAM'S FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS	14
CONCLUSION	22

## INTRODUCTION

1. The Warwick Avenue Triangle is an important hub within the city of Durban: City Commuters converge at the Warwick Avenue Triangle using road, rail and taxi transport to arrive at and depart from the City. They are serviced by numerous informal traders providing a variety of services and commodities.
2. An Early Morning Market is located within the Warwick Avenue Triangle. The Market Hall was constructed in about 1910. The building itself and the institution of the market have become important landmarks in the City's social history, and the building is a Heritage Site.
3. The market was initially purely a fresh produce market offering a facility for the marketing of fresh produce, livestock and other food related produce by market gardeners and subsistence farmers. However the market has evolved into a more significant symbol playing an important social function in the life of the City. The market is located close to the main bus and taxi terminals and rail nodes, and each day hundreds of thousands of commuters are discharged into or leave from the area. They and hundreds of street traders shop at and use the facilities offered by the market, and it has evolved into a hub of commercial activity.
4. Most importantly the market and its environment provides for both traders and consumers who would have operated outside of the formal business sector.
5. The exact number of traders operating from the market is a matter of dispute, but the Early Morning Market Traders Association states that it provides a business opportunity for approximately 600 traders and provides employment and income for approximately 2000 others (salespeople, barrow-pushers and cleaners). The City on the other hand states that there are 450 active traders using the 600 stalls in the early morning market. The City argues that 100 stalls are not occupied, and because other traders have more than 1 stall the total number of stalls that are occupied are not more than 500.

6. Whatever the precise number of traders and employment opportunities, it is clear that the market offers an important outlet for the traders, employment for unskilled labour and a central source for street traders to draw their stock from.
7. The eThekweni Municipality proposes to upgrade the Warwick Avenue Triangle which will include demolishing the Early Morning Market and leasing the site to a private entity to construct the Warwick Mall in order to reduce and reorganize traffic and public transport in the area and to upgrade commuter facilities and modes.
8. They state that this would provide a retail development mall which would include a taxi garage / rank. The development would create an integrated transport hub with opportunities for both informal and formal trade. This would provide a formal shopping area and space and decent accommodation for all street traders. Commuter needs would be provided through the integration of various ranks and mini hubs, and commuter safety and road traffic considerations would be enhanced by removing the Western Freeway traffic from the area through the construction of overpasses.
9. The city contends that this will provide for seamless integration between taxis, trains and busses with better public facilities, shopping facilities and open spaces for commuters. It further contends that better and more modern facilities will be provided for traders doing business in and around the Warwick Triangle area.
10. This has provoked a public outcry from civic associations, the trade union sector, community associations, traders' associations, religious leaders, academics, and some members of the general public and some rate-payers of eThekweni. The debate has become inflamed and at least 4 court cases have followed.
11. On the other hand, support for the development has been received from many stakeholders, who include taxi-operators, the bovine head cookers, street traders, bus operators, the Durban Chamber of Commerce and Industry, and from at least 27 stake-holders.

12. Given the intensity of the reaction to the proposed development the Provincial Executive has appointed a Provincial task Team to consider the matter, and to report to the Executive Council thereon.

## **THE TASK TEAM AND ITS MODUS OPERANDI**

13. The Provincial Executive Council appointed a Task Team of Michael Mabuyakhulu, Willies Mchunu and Bheki Cele, respectively members of the Executive Council responsible for Economic Development and Tourism; Local Government and Traditional Affairs; and Transport and Safety and Security.<sup>1</sup>
14. The Task Team is not a commission of enquiry and does not purport to make findings of fact. Rather it has sought to obtain background information into the dispute and has invited representations and submissions from affected or interested parties on the dispute, and on possible means to resolve the impasse. It seeks to achieve common ground and a “win-win” solution to the issue. It must however be stressed that “win-win” means benefits for interested parties. That is, those with a direct and substantial interest in the matter. We however consider our findings and recommendations to be so important that it would not be in the public interest or that of any party not to implement our recommendations and findings.
15. The Early Morning Market Traders Association has attempted to interdict the eviction of their members pending a review of the council’s decision. A similar application was brought by barrow operators / trolley pushers to prevent the municipality from preventing them from carrying on their trade at the market. (The outcome of these cases are not known at the time of drafting this report.)
16. What is however clear from the process is that:-
  - (a) The parties are deeply divided;
  - (b) The dispute is characterized by the heightened atmosphere of high emotions and deeply held subjective positions;

<sup>1</sup>Since the commencement of this process the MEC for Transport, Safety and Security has been appointed as the national Commissioner of Police, and the MEC for Local Government and Traditional Affairs has been appointed in his place.

- (c) The potential for disharmony and waning social trust between the protagonists is great.
17. It has also emerged that there are a number of parties or classes of parties who are involved in this dispute. These include:-
- (a) The Provincial Government;
  - (b) The law enforcement agencies (be they national police or municipal police);
  - (c) The municipality;
  - (d) Traders who lease stalls from the municipality;
  - (e) Traders who occupy stalls and carry on business at the Early Morning Market, but who may not derive their right of occupation from the municipality, (referred to as “illegal traders” by the municipality);
  - (f) Those employed by the stakeholders;
  - (g) Those who utilize the services of the stakeholders (either as street traders themselves or as shoppers).
18. What seems to have emerged is that certain traders do so without permits, and other traders occupy stalls under a sub-tenancy agreement.

## SUBMISSIONS AND REPRESENTATIONS RECEIVED BY THE TASK TEAM

19. The Task Team does not intend to repeat each and every submission received by it from role players and interested parties. Similarly the Task Team does not intend to summarise each submission, and where submissions have been made by other parties they have not been restated.
  
20. The **eThekweni Municipality** has provided a written submission and a three page summary of its views on the aims, objectives and benefits of the development. In summary:-
  - (a) The Warwick Avenue Triangle is a transport hub for road, rail, bus and taxi transport providing for 400,000 commuters daily;
  - (b) The Junction provides for a number of formal and informal trading opportunities for commuters;
  - (c) The informal nature of the development has led to a number of serious accidents (approximately 500 per year) as well as “crime and grime” in the area;
  - (d) The municipality wishes to provide a single rank for southbound taxis, with proper washing facilities and kiosks for the traders that service the taxi users;
  - (e) The Mall development will incorporate the informal sector into the more formal sector providing “graduation opportunities” and facilities and kiosks for them;
  - (f) The Mall will provide economic opportunities for previously disadvantaged individuals, will attract investors and provide B-BBEE opportunities;
  - (g) The developer will construct a mall and has acquired aerial rights from the South African Rail Commuter Corporation to build a ramp from the Southern Freeway to the new taxi rank, which the developer will construct to no cost to the city;

- (h) Linkage will be provided between the Mall, station and bus terminal by pedestrian bridges;
- (i) The 267 displaced traders would be accommodated in a public space to be known as Masigiye Square (by contrast, the developers put this figure at 240 traders developers);
- (j) The city claims support from the taxi industry, street traders, trader organizations, small businesses, the Durban Chamber of Commerce, emerging contractors and black investors;
- (k) The city contends that the Early Morning Market has approximately 500 lease holders, of whom only between 130 / 150 operate stalls at the market. The balance are “illegal” lease holders, who are in fact paying rent to the original lease holders. The city contends that it does not benefit from this rental income because it is retained by the original lease holders.
- (l) The city proposes options to provide for early morning market traders in the construction phase, and for sites to be allocated by the city’s allocation policy.

21. **COSATU** too has made a written submission to the Task Team:-

- (a) It supports developmental projects in principle, but based on a consultative government;
- (b) It is disappointed at the municipality’s manner of dealing with the matter and expresses concern at the commitment of “millions and millions” of Rands of public funds to build a mall on the current site
- (c) It is concerned about the failure to call for expressions of interest, the failure of the municipality to comply with an EIA process and the failure of the city to secure the appropriate permit to demolish the listed building.

- (d) It expresses concern that the proposed B-BBEE objectives do not include the black informal traders.

22. **The South African Communist Party** supports the upgrading and redesign of the public transport system, but expresses concerns over:-

- (a) The flawed consultation process;
- (b) The failure to consider the views of workers and the poor;
- (c) The failure to preserve a heritage site important in the mass movement; the lack of transparency with the process;
- (d) The failure to cater for African share ownership;
- (e) The failure to cater for informal traders; and
- (f) The failure to accurately measure the economic benefit of the market.

23. **The Legal Resources Centre** has made written submissions:-

- (a) It is concerned that informal and marginalized traders (such as barrow pushers and bovine head cookers) will not benefit and be accommodated in a more formal market / mall trading environment.
- (b) They contend that the development is flawed from a legal and developmental point of view from a number of points of view, for the following reasons (among others):-
  - (i) The destruction of a city landmark of historical and social significance;
  - (ii) The failure by the Municipality to conduct an Environmental Impact Assessment (EIA);

- (iii) The size of the proposed mall (stated to be double the usual floor space threshold) and
- (iv) The proposed socio-economic model is flawed (the model of mall shopping as opposed to market shopping resulting in the number and range of beneficiaries of the product supply chain being reduced).

**Warwick Mall (Pty) Limited** (developers of the Mall) have made written submissions, and have provided the following background information:-

- (a) The shareholding structure is as follows:-
  - (i) Warwick investments, represented by C Correia (35%);
  - (ii) Heriot Properties, represented by S Herring (35%);
  - (iii) Ryden International Property Consultants, represented by M Gallant (10%);
  - (iv) Mbali Coastal Developments, represented by T Ngcobo (5%);
  - (v) Mamokete Investments, represented by N Tutu (4%);
  - (vi) Ubisi Investments, represented by N Moyo (4%);
  - (vii) Masengasilele Investments, represented by L Qupe (2%);
  - (viii) The Taxi Industry, represented by Y Khaliva (5%).
- (b) They state that members of their consortium have been involved in numerous retail projects in under-developed areas and other intermodal developments.

- (c) They deny that the process of engagement with the City was flawed and had negotiated with Intersite and the City since 2005 and 2007, respectively. They deny that the project was secret or rushed, and state that the minutes of the various meetings are public documents, open to all.
- (d) They confirm that that the project has been planned and they have conducted a full feasibility study.
- (e) In their view the area is “romanticised”, and in fact is found by the public to be unappealing.
- (f) The mall will offer a wide range of offerings, with an appropriate tenant mix to serve anticipated customer profile. Buyers will be able to purchase from both the informal and formal sector.
- (g) They state that the development has many benefits:-
  - (i) A wider choice of retail offerings;
  - (ii) Improved traffic flow;
  - (iii) Covered ranks providing security and cover from the weather;
  - (iv) Hygienic and dignified ablution facilities;
  - (v) Employment in the construction phase;
  - (vi) Employment in the final phase (which they state excludes the work opportunities for traders).
- (h) They state that they are sensitive to the heritage aspects, and are investigating how the historical aspects can be provided for, and are also available to receive suggestions in this regard.

- (i) They state that informal traders will be an integral part of the centre with stalls in public space (Masigiye Square) for 240 street traders. They will provide ablution and lock-up facilities. The traders will not pay for these facilities, but will pay licence fees to the City. They will be guided by the City and Early Morning Market Traders Association in the interim phase.
  - (j) They point out that they have tight deadlines, and hence a speedy resolution of the impasse is required
25. Submissions were also received on behalf of **barrow pushers** and the **Warwick Bovine Head Sellers**:-
- (a) The former call for a halt to plans to develop the mall. They are against the “unilateral” decision to build the mall. They state that the mall will benefit “big names” only. They are not against the development per se, but state that the development must benefit all.
  - (b) They demand that the Early Morning Market be kept running. They are fearful that their role will fall away if the market is closed.
  - (c) They express concern at the role of Police in the Market (which appears to be outside of the mandate of the Task Team).
  - (d) They complain of a lack of consultation and ask for the municipality to discuss the development with them.
  - (e) They ask for benefits to be shared, and for training and skills development.
  - (f) The latter support the development and have been promised a trading position. They however also ask for certain additional amenities (a table, cabinet, electricity and a place for customers to eat).
  - (g) They express concern for their safety in the present location (from a crime and road traffic point of view).

26. **Other submissions** received made the following comments:-

- (a) Concern was expressed about the danger to pedestrians, and the improvement which the development will bring to enhance the safety of informal traders and pedestrians.
- (b) The view was expressed that informal traders should be allowed to trade inside and around the mall, creating an economic benefit. Traders will be empowered by operating through cooperatives to consolidate buying power.
- (c) The view was expressed that “market prices are based on colour, there is an Indian price, European and African price”.
- (d) The view is that the traders should be provided for in a memorandum of understanding to provide certainty and to provide clarity on how traders will be provided for.
- (e) The view was stated that the current market is old and needs to be renovated, and needs to be developed to the benefit of all sectors.
- (f) A view stated more often is that the market provides for “Indian interests”, and all race groups should be accommodated.
- (g) Traffic, business and pedestrian facilities should be upgraded.
- (h) Pedestrian congestion and high traffic volumes has resulted in high crime rates and accidents.
- (i) The development will be accepted provided street traders are catered for.
- (j) The development should cater for informal operators, and provide for equity holding opportunities for these traders in the anchor tenants.
- (k) The initiative will provide growth opportunities and graduation to more formal and bigger business opportunities.

27. Various petitions have also been received expressing opposition to the proposed development. These do not set out any stated or additional grounds to the petitioners' opposition.

### **ISSUES WHICH ARE COMMON CAUSE BETWEEN THE PARTIES**

28. The following issues or objectives appear to be common between all parties. It must however be stressed that although the parties agree on an issue or objective, they do not always agree on the mechanism to achieve the objective in question. The common ground issues or objectives are:-
- (a) The need to upgrade commuter facilities;
  - (b) The need to upgrade facilities for taxi-operators;
  - (c) The need to upgrade trading facilities;
  - (d) The need to upgrade traffic and road safety facilities;
  - (e) The socio-economic importance of the area as a hub;
  - (f) The need to address "crime and grime" in the area;
  - (g) The need to incorporate the informal sector into the more formal sector providing "graduation opportunities" and facilities and kiosks for them;
  - (h) The need to provide economic opportunities for previously disadvantaged individuals and to provide B-BBEE opportunities;
  - (i) The need to attract investors.

## ISSUES IN DISPUTE BETWEEN THE PARTIES

29. The following issues appear to be in dispute.
- (a) The failure of the municipality to adequately consult with all interested parties and role-players;
  - (b) The position of the absent lease-holders who act as tenant farmers to “illegal” lease holders;
  - (c) The means to provide for early morning market traders in the construction phase;
  - (d) The mechanism to provide site allocation by the municipality in the future;
  - (e) The failure by the municipality to call for expressions of interest;
  - (f) The failure of the municipality to comply with an EIA process;
  - (g) The failure of the municipality to secure the appropriate permit to demolish the listed building, and the failure to preserve an important heritage site;
  - (h) The B-BBEE outcomes in the project and the failure to cater for African share ownership or the economically marginalised;
  - (i) The failure to include the black informal traders within the project, or to provide them with an equity holding in the project.
  - (j) The failure to consider the views of workers and the poor;
  - (k) The lack of transparency in the process;

- (l) The failure to provide for informal and marginalized traders (such as barrow pushers and bovine head cookers) or to accommodate them in a more formal market / mall trading environment.
  - (m) The flawed proposed socio-economic model of mall shopping as opposed to market shopping resulting in the number and range of beneficiaries of the product supply chain being reduced).
30. The Task Team does not express a view on these points of dispute or their validity.
31. A further significant issue of dispute or point of division is the perception of abuse by traders of Indian descent, who are viewed as exploitative.

## **THE TASK TEAM'S FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS**

### **The need to provide for all interests parties**

32. There is a clear need to determine who the “interested parties” in this matter are. Thereafter the rights and interests of those parties must be provided for in the new development. The determining factor should be which parties have direct rights and interests to be protected, for example, the most marginalised of these sectors, such as barrow pushers, bovine head cookers and street traders who rely on produce and stock from the Early Morning Market. Other sectors to be provided for would be:-
- (a) Traders (both within the market and those who trade informally on the fringes);
  - (b) Commuters;
  - (c) Taxi-operators;
  - (d) Tourists;

- (e) The Municipality (as regulator);
- (f) The developers;
- (g) Road traffic regulators.

(This is not a closed list.)

- 33. The interests of these sectors should be provided for in any future development.
- 34. Any exploitative relationships should be terminated. For example, the Municipality has provided sites to certain traders who no longer utilise the sites, and who sub-let these to sub-tenants. (The Municipality estimates that this practise may be followed by approximately 250 of the original traders.) These arrangements can in certain cases be exploitative and negative consequences flow – rents are not paid to the municipality, sub-tenants are exploited and required to purchase their stock from one source resulting in monopolistic practises. Most importantly, however, these trading sites are regarded as “graduation opportunities”. That is, these provide a start-up facility from which traders may graduate as and when they are able to do so. If traders actually graduate from their sites, but retain these and demand rent for the sites then the entire system is abused.
- 35. This practice, in our view, is untenable, and should be terminated.

**The need to provide for all sectors, even the marginalised**

- 36. Certain activities are regarded as marginalised and in certain cases unwelcome. The new facility must recognise and provide for these sectors.
- 37. It will be necessary to design the development so that no one trading sector is catered for to the detriment of any other sector.
- 38. Facilities must be providing for all interests groups (taxi-ranks, washing facilities for operators and conductors, facilities for commuters).
- 39. Facilities must be provided to all applicable standards (safety, hygienic etc ...).

### **The benefits of the development must be recognised**

40. The development will contribute to the significant upgrading of the area. There will be an economic development to the city as a whole. This fact should not be minimalised or glossed over due to the atmosphere of high emotions and mistrust.

### **The consultative process should be re-opened**

41. The Task Team is aware that the municipality is of the opinion that it has consulted extensively and that it had commenced public consultation on this process in February 2009, and had conducted a number of meetings and workshops on the proposed mall. The municipality states that this process took place before the decision to lease the premises was taken.
42. The fact remains that numerous stakeholders have complained of inadequate consultation, and the perception of a lack of consultation has fuelled the resentment to the project. However, consultation can not be endless. There is a distinction between disagreement with what is being proposed, and not being consulted. As a task team we do not believe that those who do not agree with the proposed development should therefore use the argument of lack of consultation as the main complaint. In this regard the task team strongly believe that all consultation must be time bound, and therefore we recommend that all consultation should be concluded as soon as possible, but not later than 30 September 2009.

### **The need to conclude a memorandum of understanding between stakeholders**

43. At present various stakeholders believe that they are not provided for in the development, or that their views have not been canvassed. There is also considerable misunderstanding due to rumour-mongering and those with personal interests putting out this information.

44. A memorandum of understanding between the various stakeholders would not only aid the consultative process, but ensure that all stakeholders are catered for, and let them see that they are catered for. There would be no misunderstandings or misperceptions. This process may also contribute to the healing of rifts which exist. We however wish to state that we are by no means advocating for those in authority not to exercise their power of decision-making, as required by law. Our issue though is that in exercising those powers we urge those in authority to do so with the greatest circumspection.

### **Recognition of the Symbolic and Historical Significance of the Site**

45. The Early Morning Market is a site of historical significance. The building is also architecturally significant. Where possible, attempts should be made to incorporate the buildings in the development.

### **Black Economic Empowerment Objectives**

46. The city has stated that the developer comprises 51% black economic partners, of whom approximately 26% are African. This has led to criticisms that there is not sufficient African representation; that traders are not provided for; and that a handful of wealthy individuals will benefit. This issue will need to be further considered. However we strongly believe that informal traders must be granted equity participation so that they benefit from the development, and so that the empowerment is broad-based.
47. Other means of catering for the traders should also be examined. For example a portion of equity may be held by community based trusts, or alternatively, mechanisms which do not provide equity to the traders, but give them other economic advantages could be discussed and determined.

### **The Need to De-Racialise the Debate**

48. The debate has taken unfortunate racial overtones. The task team is extremely concerned about this as it is divisive and we warn against any parties who racialise the debate. This matter must be solely dealt with within the need to provide for the economic dispossessed (the marginalised and informal traders), and that it is these parties who must be accommodated within the main stream of society in order to provide for graduation opportunities.
49. We also warn against this issue being personalised. We should rather seek a solution that deepens healthy debate and discussion, but without character assassination of individual personalities.

### **Address Administrative Issues**

50. There is a need to address outstanding administrative and environmental issues. For example the environmental impact assessment process must be completed, and the process of the appeal by the city to the Premier on the AMAFA refusal to demolish the market building should be finalized. The development rights should be analyzed. These matters will need to be dealt with by no later than 31 October 2009.

### **Openness and Transparency**

51. There is a perception that the process was not fully and openly transparent, and that appropriate procurement processes were not followed. The city must make full disclosure on all aspects of the projects, including whether there was a tender or unsolicited bid process, how this was determined. Other matters that had been raised (such as the development rights, the nature of the deal, the developers and how the consortium is structured), have now been answered by the developers.

52. The public are also not aware that the developer had engaged with Intersite for the utilisation of the bulk of the land for the development prior to engagement with the City, and that the land the City is making available to the developers supplements the Intersite land. This misunderstanding appears to have led to allegations that the developers were favoured by the City when this was not the case.

### **Existing Right Holders must be catered for**

53. The mall must provide for accommodation for fresh market traders, and permit holders in the current market must be provided for and given trading facilities in the new market. All those who are currently trading as “illegal traders” must be regularised and be immediately and unconditionally issued with permits. The principle of “one stall - one permit – one user” must be adhered to and be rigorously enforced.

### **Facilities must be Provided for Marginal Traders**

54. Marginal activities such as the bovine head traders and street traders need to be provided with suitable facilities (including lockable facilities, electricity, tables and ablution), and should be located near to the taxi facilities. This is to ensure that they derive economic development from the benefit, that their standing is improved, and that they have facilities.
55. Street traders should also be located on the same floor as taxis. They too should be provided with lockable facilities, storage and the like.

### **Temporary Facilities**

56. During the construction phase there should be a temporary trading facility with basic amenities. Such a temporary trading facility must be suitable for traders to do their business in all weather conditions.

### **City to Provide Basic Services**

57. The city should provide all basic amenities such as 24 hour protection, round the clock refuse and clean up services, given the nature of the development and its extensive hours of operation.

### **Expedite Resolution of this Matter**

58. All outstanding aspects of this should be expedited to ensure that this matter is resolved as quickly as possible. In this regard we urge that all parties and stakeholders must adhere to the stipulated time lines.

### **To Consolidate and Maintain the Development**

59. It is imperative that various role players commit themselves to the development. It is important to send a message to the financiers and developers that the city wishes to proceed with the matter, and that it is an issue of dealing with outstanding issues. This would also include a commitment from the Provincial Government to expedite the process of the appeal against the AMAFA decision for the interests of certainty.

### **Finalisation of Informal Trade Policy**

60. The MEC for Economic Development and Tourism and his department should expedite the finalisation of an informal trade policy.

### **EIA Assessment**

61. It is important that the EIA assessment on the current site be brought to a head given that this is not a Greenfield development project.

### **Relationship Building**

62. Of great concern to the Provincial Government and the task team is the breakdown in relationship between the city, traders and various other constituencies. The parties must make proposal on how this issue can be addressed to avoid future actions. We recommend that the parties should attend suitable relationship building exercises.
63. All law enforcement agencies should exercise restraint.
64. The South African Police and the Municipal Police should exercise restraint to avoid over exaggerated action, now and in the future.

### **The Tourism Possibilities of the Project Must be Recognised**

65. There are a number of practices within the market which would be of great interest to tourists. Not only is there the “muti-market”, but the informal nature of the trading will be of great interest to tourist.

### **Legal Disputes**

66. All legal disputes should be settled to avoid any sense of a winner and loser, and to prevent a court having to rule on any of the outstanding matters.

## **CONCLUSION**

67. The task team thanks all the stakeholders for their assistance and support to enable us to finalise this report, as well as for their detailed written submissions. We also wish to thank those who appeared before us to make oral submissions. These were all helpful and enabled us to understand the dynamics of the situation. It is recognised that the situation at the Warwick Avenue Triangle arises from a specific historical situation, borne of apartheid, specific transport systems and antiquated trading systems. We however believe that the issues that have given rise to the Premier and the Cabinet appointing this task team could have been avoided if all parties concerned appreciated the concerns of one another and likewise responded to each other in a manner that created confidence that their legitimate concerns were heard and considered.
68. The provincial task team commits itself to taking appropriate steps to assist in the resolution of this matter.

Honourable Michael Mabuyakhulu, MPP  
CHAIRMAN OF THE TASK TEAM  
MEMBER OF THE EXECUTIVE COUNCIL FOR KWAZULU-NATAL

Honourable Willies Thembinkosi Mchunu, MPP  
MEMBER OF THE EXECUTIVE COUNCIL FOR KWAZULU-NATAL